

**NORTHERN LIGHTHOUSE BOARD  
NAVIGATION COMMITTEE**

**MINUTES – 19 June 2019**

<b>PRESENT:</b>	Alastair Beveridge	Chair
	Mike Brew	Commissioner
	Hugh Shaw	Commissioner
	Duncan Murray	Commissioner
	Mike Bullock	Chief Executive
	Phil Day	Director of Operations
	Peter Douglas	Navigation Manager
	Paul Hudson	Programme and Renewals Manager
	Andrew Stevenson	Assets Manager
	Karen Charleson	Senior Executive Assistant (notes)

**1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

There were no apologies for absence noted. The Chair welcomed Commissioner Murray to his first meeting of the Navigation Committee.

**2. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

The Minutes of the Navigation Committee meeting held on 21 March 2019 were agreed. It was agreed that a copy could be published on the website.

*Action: Senior Executive Assistant*

**3. MATTERS ARISING**

The Committee noted that Matters Arising from the previous meeting would be addressed within the relevant subject areas.

**4. OPERATIONAL REQUIREMENTS**

The Committee noted the report and discussion took place on the following items:

2020 AtoN Review

The Committee noted the AtoN Review programme as follows:

- September 2019 - Navigation Committee review of all proposed actions, including additional data as required
- October 2019 - GLA Peer Review of all supporting Risk Assessments
- November 2019 - Present proposed changes to SUCG
- December 2019 - Navigation Committee review of draft output document
- 2020 (tbc.) - to Chief Executives' Committee and all GLA Boards for approval
- May 2020 - publish at JUCG

The Committee noted the papers on the first draft of outputs from the review for areas 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8. It was acknowledged that some of the text within the outputs required to be updated to include e.g. tidal and wave power data.

It was also noted that twenty eight days of AIS Data for July/August 2018 has been sourced and screenshots were viewed.

In particular, the Committee discussed the following:

#### Area 4 - Scotland North Coast; Orkney Islands (excluding Pentland Firth)

- North Rona - Re-engineer with a minimum 18nM range. Agreed in principle but to come back to the Committee with what options are available when required. It was agreed that a reliable 18nM light was better than an unreliable bigger light.
- Auskerry - Re-engineer with a minimum 18nM range
- Start Point - Re-engineer, maintain existing 18nM range
- North Ronaldsay - Retain 24nM range subject to exigencies of a technical solution.
- Noup Head - Re-engineer with a minimum 18nM range
- Sula Skeir – It was noted that there is no intention to review this light.
- Skerry of Ness - Re-engineer as LED sector light without green sector, but maintaining 090 cutoff.

#### Area 5 - Pentland Firth

- Pentland Skerries – Retain 23 nM range subject to a technical solution.
- Dunnet Head - Re-engineer with a minimum 18nM range. This had been previously agreed by the Navigation Committee.
- AIS & Virtual AIS Capability - Add to Duncansby Head. Replace Pentland Skerries Physical AIS with Virtual AtoN for Pentland Skerries and Sandy Riddle. The Director of Operations will check with Trinity House to ensure that technically we are able to do that and will report back to the September meeting.

**Action: Director of Operations**

#### Area 6 - Shetland Islands

- Foula - Re-engineer and establish red sector to East, maintain 17nM range.
- Muckle Flugga - Re-engineer with minimum 18nM range. This had been previously agreed by the Navigation Committee.
- Out Skerries - Re-engineer with minimum 18nM range
- Sumburgh Head - Retain 23nM range subject to a technical solution
- Fair isle North - Re-engineer with minimum 18nM range
- Fair Isle South - Re-engineer with minimum 18nM range. This had been previously agreed by the Navigation Committee
- Hoo Stack - Re-engineer with LED sector light and discontinue Directional light. This has been previously agreed by the Navigation Committee.
- Bullia Skerry - Reduce range from 5nM to 3nM. Agreed that the Navigation Manager would discuss the proposed change with Shetland Island Council.

**Action: Navigation Manager**

#### Firths Voe

The Navigation Committee discussed the design received from the consultant engineers and agreed to look at alternatives to avoid this work and to also protect the site for the longer-term. The Director of Operations will report back to the Committee with a proposed solution and timeline when required.

**Action: Director of Operations**

### Area 7 - Clythness to Rattray Head

- AIS & Virtual AIS Capability - Add to Kinnaird Head. Agreed in principle. Noted that there are likely to be more windfarms in the area in the future.

### Area 8 - Rattray Head to St Abb's Head

- Bell Rock - Re-engineer and retain a minimum 18nM range.
- Girdleness – Retain a 22nM range subject to a technical solution.
- AIS & Virtual AIS Capability - Add to Buchan Ness, Fife Ness and St Abbs Head

### L4 and Macaskill Rock Buoys

The Navigation Manager asked the Committee to consider whether the buoys should be replaced with perches. It was agreed to note this proposal and discuss at a future date.

**Action: Navigation Manager**

### Oban Bay

The Committee noted that feedback to date on the changes to buoyage has been positive, with a much reduced number of vessels straying onto the Corran Ledge. It is intended to hold another Local Users' workshop in November to formalise feedback. Commissioners had the opportunity to look at the new buoyage during the Inspection Voyage and also provided positive feedback.

### Annual Report 2018/19

The Committee noted the draft Annual Report of Inspections of LLAs, Offshore Structures and Aquaculture included within the meeting papers. Subject to some minor amendments the Committee approved the Annual Report. This will now be forwarded to the Department for Transport, as required by the Merchant Shipping Act 1995, and other interested parties.

**Action: Navigation Manager**

### GNSS Vulnerability

Further to discussion at JSB, the GLA's position on GNSS Vulnerability is referenced in the Strategy document 2030 - Navigating the Future and also within the Marine Navigation Plan 2016 -2030. It is intended that the 2020 AtoN Review will again emphasise the role of other aids to navigation in managing the risk of GNSS vulnerability.

### Port Marine Safety Code Audit

It was noted that re-audits were undertaken of Fraserburgh Harbour and Moray Council. No issues were noted.

### GNSS update

The Committee noted that Beidou 3-11 was launched on 20 April, Compass G8 (geostationary) was launched on 17 May and GLONASS 758 was launched on 27 May. All are currently in commissioning status. It was noted that there is no significant risk posed to NLB due to being unable to access the secure channel provided by GALILEO following Brexit.

### Marine Licence and Sanction Requests

The Committee noted the summary of Marine Licence Activity and Sanctions for the establishment/disestablishment of AtoN.

## 5. ENGINEERING

The Committee noted and discussed the Engineering report:

### Programme and Renewals

Temporary lights remain at Copinsay, Duncansby Head (new light in final commissioning), Mull of Kintyre, and Stroma. Temporary lights have been established at Eilean Glas.

Irvine Beacon - Tenders have been received with a substantial over budget cost from all tenderers. The majority of the cost is made up with the preliminaries for piling which the ground conditions require for a beacon that is to survive. This brings into question whether there is a volume of traffic and degree of risk to justify this project. A recent MCA survey confirms there is no commercial traffic, and the lack of any investment in the port infrastructure means it cannot be considered as a functioning port. There remain a few leisure users on moorings using the harbour at their own risk. The Navigation Committee discussed that project and agreed, subject to discussion with Irvine Council, not to proceed with the project. The Chief Executive and Director of Operations would also discuss the decision with the DfT and will report back to the next meeting.

**Action: Chief Executive/Director of Operations**

Portain Beacon - Whilst still at the design phase site investigations suggest this project will also be over budget. This beacon is planned to replace an existing buoy following the Sound of Harris ferry grounding. The Navigation Committee considered the implications of an increased cost in relation to the navigational requirement and agreed, that as there has already been an incident in this areas and due to the call to increase numbers of ferries on this route, to proceed with the project as planned.

### Assets

Availability - The Committee noted the 3 year rolling availability figures to 10 June 2019. Since the last committee there has been 1 outage- over 72 hours.

Monitoring - The existing monitoring system and servers continue to operate reliably. Final assessment of the tenders has been being carried out and a final report is awaited for the Executive to make a decision on the successful tenderer. Having the top end operational by end of March 2020 remains achievable.

DGPS – The DGPS system continues to work well. The IGC5 recommendation for the future of DGPS is awaited.

### 2015 Aton Review

The Committee noted the Summary of Proposed Changes and Stations Update document for the AtoN Review.

### Cruises – Fort William

It was noted that the Navigation Manager had received a communication from the operator of the cruises into Forth William asking whether there could be south bound light established. It was agreed to add this to the discussion at the September meeting.

**Action: Navigation Manager**

## 6. NOTICES TO MARINERS

The Notices to Mariners published since the last meeting were noted.

## 7. RISK CARD REVIEW

The Committee reviewed the Risk Card and had no revisions or amendments.

## 8. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

### Review Terms of Reference

The Committee reviewed the Terms of Reference and discussed the following proposed changes:

- “The timely and efficient provision of Aids to Navigation in the territorial waters around Scotland, and the Isle of Man” - Add reference to Pollution Control Zone which goes outwith territorial waters. Commissioner Shaw to email suggested wording.
- “Proper response to Wrecks and navigational hazard marking” – Add reference to the Nairobi International Convention on the Removal of Wrecks.
- Membership – update to reflect Director changes. Review wording to reflect that a Commissioner with specialist knowledge and experience could also be considered to be a Navigation Assessor but to be careful not to dilute the professional qualifications that are required by the Navigation Committee.

It was agreed to reword sections 1 and 2 and come back to the September meeting with a proposal. Once agreed the revised Terms of Reference will be submitted to the Board of Commissioners for approval.

**Action: Chair**

### Dunollie

The Navigation Manager advised that there is currently a small maintenance project due to be underway to replace the light at Dunollie. There is no proposal to change to any of the characteristics of the lights but he is waiting on feedback from the Oban Harbour Group. The Navigation Manager will feedback to the Committee if any changes are proposed.

**Action: Navigation Manager**

## 9. DATE AND TIME OF NEXT MEETING

The next meeting of the Navigation Committee will take place on 18 September 2019 at 11am in Oban. It is planned to extend the length of the meeting to allow for a full discussion on the AtoN Review.