

**NORTHERN LIGHTHOUSE BOARD
NAVIGATION COMMITTEE**

MINUTES – 11 December 2019

PRESENT:	Alastair Beveridge	Chair
	Mike Brew	Commissioner
	Hugh Shaw	Commissioner
	Duncan Murray	Commissioner
	Mike Bullock	Chief Executive
	Phil Day	Director of Operations
	Peter Douglas	Navigation Manager
	Paul Hudson	Programme and Renewals Manager
	Karen Charleson	Senior Executive Assistant (notes)
 Observer:	 Gillian Burns	 Navigation Officer

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from the Director of Business Services and Asset Manager.

2. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

The Minutes of the Navigation Committee meeting held on 18 September 2019 were agreed. It was agreed that a copy could be published on the website.

Action: Senior Executive Assistant

3. MATTERS ARISING

The Committee noted that the majority of Matters Arising from the previous meeting would be addressed within the relevant subject areas.

4. OPERATIONAL REQUIREMENTS

The Committee noted the report and discussion took place on the following items:

2020 AtoN Review Timetable

Since the last committee meeting, the draft proposals for NLB were presented to Scottish Users Consultative Group. No written feedback has been received.

The refurbishment of Esha Ness, incorporating a reduction in range from 25nM to 18nM has been added to the Review following a number of changes to NLB's Capital Works Programme. This change was previously agreed by the Committee.

The tri-GLA Peer review meeting took place on 30 October 2019. All current Navigational Risk Assessments were signed off at this meeting.

The Committee noted the remaining AtoN Review programme is:

December 2019 – Navigation Committee review of draft output document
2020 (tbc.) – Chief Executives' Committee and all 3 Boards for approval
May 2020 – publish at Joint Users Consultative Group

Irvine

Further to discussion with Department for Transport regarding Irvine, a letter was received from the Minister on 24 October 2019 revoking the previous Direction issued to NLB to reinstate the starboard hand beacon. NLB have subsequently been in discussion with UKHO to remove all the AtoNs listed against Irvine Harbour as no lights have been viewed on recent inspection voyages.

Beatrice Wind Farm

NLV POLE STAR re-inspected the newly commissioned Beatrice offshore wind farm in September 2019. All marking and lighting was considered correct. As a result, sanction was given for the removal of the construction phase buoyage and the establishment of the permanent marking scheme.

East Loch Tarbert, Harris

Concerns have been raised regarding past groundings of leisure craft on the Whiting Rocks in East Loch Tarbert, and the potential for more such incidents, given the development of a marina in Tarbert and the resulting significant recent increase in visitor traffic. These issues have been discussed with the Isle of Harris Marina and CMAL. Although not within the CMAL harbour area, CMAL have undertaken to review, with the intention to establish a lit beacon on the Cuidsgair islet. The Committee discussed marking the rocks with either a cardinal or port hand buoy but agreed that this was for CMAL to take forward to avoid a mixture of NLB and LLA AtoNs in the area. The Navigation Manager will bring the issue back to the Committee if required.

Action: Navigation Manager

Port Marine Safety Code Audit

Re-audits were undertaken of Western Isles Council on 24 September 2019 and Stornoway Port Authority on 25 September 2019. No significant issues were noted.

Wrecks

A fishing vessel sank 3.4 miles WNW of Port Erin in the Isle of Man on 23 November 2019, in approximately 35 metres of water. Wreckage was reported as standing some 5 metres above the seabed, with the possibility of floating ropes. An analysis of traffic data for this area suggested there is little passing traffic, and no further response was considered necessary.

While MCA did issue a SAR SitRep at the time of the event it was not addressed to NLB. TH were alerted and NLB were notified by email, which unfortunately did not arrive. The procedure details that this should have been a phone call which has been reinforced with the new TH staff. The Navigation Manager has been in touch with Isle of Man Harbours to ensure that NLB are on their emergency contact list.

Traffic Analysis is currently provided by TH. The Navigation Manager has been asked to provide a review of what NLB have and determine whether NLB should purchase their own system.

Action: Navigation Manager

NLB still has an ambition to liaise with the Isle of Man Government to carry out a table top exercise. Commissioner Shaw has volunteered to help. This issue is required to be resolved before the IMO Audit next year.

GNSS update

Beidou-3 M23 & M24 were launched into Medium Earth Orbit on 22 September. Beidou-3 I3 was launched into Inclined Geosynchronous Orbit on 4 November 2019. Beidou-3 M21 & M22 were launched into Medium Earth Orbit on 23 November. All are currently in commissioning status.

It was noted that the UK has plans to build their own satellite navigation system and are looking at options.

Marine Licence and Sanction Requests

The Committee noted the summary of Marine Licence Activity and Sanctions for the establishment/disestablishment of AtoN.

2020 AtoN Review

The Committee noted and discussed the draft Aids to Navigation Review 2020-2025 document. The following points were noted:

- Reference to Resilient PNT to be included within the Introduction within the priorities section similar to the wording in the document “Navigating the Future 2030”. Include reference to providing AtoN for everyone not just fee payers. The Navigation Manager will amend prior to issuing draft.
Action: Navigation Manager
- Section 4B.2 – Amend the wording of “the traditional fishing industry has been subject to considerable change”.
- Section 4C.4 – change “establishments” to organisations. The Navigation Manager to review the wording of the section.
Action: Navigation Manager
- Section 4C.1 – Text still to be inserted.
- Section 4C.6 – Section needs to be updated to reflect climate change.
Action: Navigation Manager
- Section 4D.1 - Text being prepared.
- Areas 1 -8 – In the overview, expand on environmental protection as it is a core part of NLB business e.g SSIs, MPAs, etc.
- Fishing landings – provide a statement to explain using latest statistics available to explain the use of different year’s figures.

Area 1 - Isle of Man, North Channel and Clyde

- Point of Ayre - Re-engineer with a minimum 18 nM range
- Corsewall - Re-engineer with a minimum 18 nM range. Irish Lights and Stena content with 18nM range. No reply from P&O.
(post meeting note – P&O have written accepting this change)
- Loch Ryan - Will remain a 12 mile red light
- Pladda - Will remain a 17 mile light
- AIS and VAIS - Add to Point of Ayre and Corsewall.

Area 2 - Mull of Kintyre to Ardnamurchan

- Dubh Artach – Re-engineer with a minimum 18 nM range
- Skerryvore - Re-engineer with a minimum 18 nM range
- Bhanarach Rocks (Gigha) - Establish an East Cardinal buoy.
- Corran Narrows SE - Establish a sector light for southbound traffic.
- Loch Spelve - Reinstate unlit starboard hand beacon

Area 3 - Ardnamurchan to Barra Head; Cape Wrath to the Flannan Isles

- Monachs – removed as now outside 5 year programme.
- Cape Wrath - Re-engineer with a minimum 18 nM range.
- Haskeir - Re-engineer with a minimum 18 nM range. See what range can be achieved and bring back to Committee.
Action: Navigation Manager
- Hyskeir - Re-engineer with a minimum 18nM range
- Ornsay - Re-engineer, maintain existing 12nM range
- Dunvegan - Re-engineer as LED sector light

- Whale Rock buoy - Replace with virtual AIS transmitted from St Kilda/Flannans/Haskeir. No objections raised from SUCG meeting.
- Portain - Replace buoy with lit beacon.
- Eileanan Dubha (Lochalsh) - Trial daytime conspicuity switching for use in restricted visibility.
- AIS & Virtual AIS Capability - Add to Neist Point, Eilean Glas and Rubh Re.

Area 4 – Scotland North Coast; Orkney Islands (excluding Pentland Firth)

- Paragraph 3 – change year from “2010” to “2015”.
- Start Point - Re-engineer, maintain existing 18nM range
- Skerry of Ness - Re-engineer as LED light with no green sector but precise cut-off at 090°

Area 5 –Pentland Firth

- Paragraph 4 – edit wording
- Action: Navigation Manager**
- Pentland Skerries - Re-engineer, maintain existing 23 nM range
 - AIS & Virtual AIS Capability - Add to Duncansby Head; establish permanent Virtual AtoN for Sandy Riddle

Area 6 – Shetland Islands

- Foula – Re-engineer and establish red sector to East (257° - 277°); maintain 17nM range
- Muckle Flugga – Re-engineer with minimum 18nM range
- Out Skerries – Re-engineer with minimum 18nM range
- Sumburgh Head – Re-engineer, maintain existing 23nM range
- Esha Ness - Re-engineer with minimum 18nM range
- Fair Isle North - Re-engineer with minimum 18nM range
- Fair Isle South – Re-engineer with minimum 18nM range
- Hoo Stack - Re-engineer with LED sector light and discontinue Directional light
- Bullia Skerry - Reduce range from 5nM to 3nM

Area 7 - Clythness to Rattray Head

- New title required
- Chart – requires updating (Clythness)
- AIS & Virtual AIS Capability - Add to Kinnaird Head.

Area 8 - Rattray Head to St Abb's Head

- Proposed ferry route (Rosyth) - added
 - Dundee Oil Refinery – Need to check
- Action: Navigation Manager**
- Bell Rock - Re-engineer retaining an 18 mile light
 - Girdle Ness – Re-engineer retaining a 22 mile light.
 - AIS & Virtual AIS Capability - Add to Buchan Ness, Fife Ness and St Abbs Head.

It was agreed that any projects that have been carried forward from a previous year should be labelled as such. Also, a reference to the discontinuation of DGPS in 2022 e.g. at Sumburgh Head should be added to each area affected.

Action: Navigation Manager

Section 13

Ensure all changes since 2015 are summarised. The Navigation Manager will check what TH/IL will put in and amend accordingly.

Action: Navigation Manager

Section 16

Excel spreadsheet still to be added.

Action: Navigation Manager

Front Cover

Fiona Holmes to be asked to provide a front cover.

Action: Navigation Manager

Navigational Risk Assessment of the Upper Loch Linnhe area

The Committee noted the report which examines current and potential activity in the area, and whether the current mix of Aids to navigation is appropriate. The Committee discussed the proposals and agreed:

- not to paint the Sallachan beacon but to revisit if raised in the future
- the combination of the head mark provided by Corran Point light, the sector light and the Clovullin Flat buoy have successfully mitigated the risk of grounding on the flats west of Rubha Cuil-cheanna. No further action is required at this time.
- to mark the ledge South of Corran Point Light with a buoy or perch would be difficult to maintain and would increase the allision hazard to both cruise vessels and other vessels transiting the Narrows.
- To assist vessels transiting south through Corran Narrows, replicate the directional light located at Corran Narrows NE with a low structure on the South West side of the headland adjacent to Rubha Cuil- Cheanna A suitable piece of land has been identified to establish a light and the landowner is amenable to the idea. However, land acquisition can take time (approx. 2 years). The Navigation Manager will investigate whether it would be agreeable with the landowner to put a temporary mark on the land until the purchase is settled and the Renewals Manager will look at what would be technically feasible e.g light on top of buoy structure, and will report back to the next meeting.

Action: Navigation Manager / Renewals Manager

5. ENGINEERING

The Committee noted and discussed the Engineering report:

Programme and Renewals

Temporary lights remain at Mull of Kintyre, and Stroma. A temporary light was established at Butt of Lewis on 5 December 2019.

Assets

Availability - The Committee noted the 3 year rolling availability figures to 30 November 2019. There has been an increase in Racon failures due to their age e.g. 40% are now over 20 years old. These units will now be changed out at re-engineering.

Monitoring - The existing monitoring system and servers continue to operate reliably. The development of the replacement top end continues. A specification has been drawn up and procurement has commenced on the hardware components necessary for the new network required to host the monitoring system. An order for RTU is to be placed shortly and possible communications for PSTN replacement in 2021 is being considered.

2015 Aton Review

The Committee noted the Summary of Proposed Changes and Stations Update document for the AtoN Review.

Sealite

It was noted that there has been configuration/reliability issues with the recently capitalized longer range lights and AIS lanterns. Some of the lights have now failed but as they are bifiform if one fails the other one is light which means it is not a casualty. A productive meeting was held with Sealite

and they were quite receptive accepting this is a quality issues either with them or the manufacturer. TH use the same lights and are having similar issues.

6. NOTICES TO MARINERS

The Notices to Mariners published since the last meeting were noted.

7. RISK CARD REVIEW

The Committee reviewed the Risk Card and had no revisions or amendments.

8. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Glasgow Nautical College

It was agreed to arrange for the September 2020 meeting to be held at Glasgow Nautical College. This would be an open meeting for cadets to attend.

Action: Mike Bullock

Commissioners Voyages

It was agreed that the Director of Operation will provide a presentation during the Inspection Voyages. The presentation will cover the whole project process from planning, Navigation Committee input, procurement, legal, neighbours, etc to work commencing on site. If possible this will include a site visit.

Action: Phil Day

9. DATE AND TIME OF NEXT MEETING

The next meeting of the Navigation Committee will take place on 19 March 2020 at 10am in Stevenson Room 2.