NORTHERN LIGHTHOUSE BOARD
NAVIGATION AND OPERATIONS COMMITTEE

MINUTES – 17 JANUARY 2024

PRESENT:	Hugh Shaw	Chair
	Brian Archibald	Commissioner
	Jamie Finlay	Commissioner
	Dick Welsh	Commissioner
	Mike Bullock	Chief Executive
	Phil Day	Director of Operations
	Mairi Rae	Director of Business Services
	Peter Douglas	Navigation Manager
	Andrew Stevenson	Asset Manager
	Paul Hudson	Programme and Renewals Manager
	Joe Jeffrey	Delivery and Planning Manager
	Gillian Burns	Navigation Officer
	Adam Lewis	Coastal Inspector
	Karen Charleson	Senior Executive Assistant (Notes)
	Elaine Wilkinson	Commissioner (Observer)

ASSURANCE STATEMENT

The Navigation and Operations Committee met on 17 January 2024. The agenda covered key areas including: Navigation, Operations and Business Services reports; Recent marine incidents and assessment of AtoN adequacy; Engineering requirements for existing AtoNs and future options for forthcoming projects; NLB lighthouse tender fleet status and helicopter operations; and Climate Change operational adaption measures.

The Committee can confirm that assurance was received in relation to all key issues.

- The Executive provided the necessary assurance that every effort was being made to attain, or exceed, the IALA recommended CAT 1 AtoN availability level.

- The Capital and Maintenance Programme remains under review and is subject to modification as operational priorities change.

- The Risk Cards for Aids to Navigation Provision, Asset Loss or Damage, Information Technology and Operational Technology, Technological Change and Obsolescence and Natural Events have been viewed by the committee and are updated on a regular basis.

The Committee wishes to draw the Governance Board's attention to the following issues:

- The AtoN Category 1 availability is currently at 99.82%, is a slight increase since the last meeting, and exceeds the IALA recommended level. Minor fluctuations can be expected over the winter months as adverse weather and helicopter availability impact response times. Category 2 and 3 availabilities are well above the IALA Standard.

- Six incidents have been reported since the last meeting:

  - On 16 November the fishing vessel SUSTAIN (UL45) ran aground in Loch Broom. To date, attempts to refloat her have proved unsuccessful.

  - On 23 November the 90 metre LPG carrier GAS ARJUNA suffered steering gear failure NW of Stroma. The vessel was attempting a Pentland Firth transit with the tide (4 kts) and against

the wind (25 kts NW'ly). The Director of Operations has reminded the MCA of their action to implement navigational & safety warnings in such circumstances. Fortunately, the vessel managed to keep clear of any hazards.

- On, or around, 27 November a feed barge at Gob a Bharra fish farm sank in Loch Fyne. The barge will be salvaged as soon as possible.

- On 28 November the fishing vessel HEATHER ISLE sank in Loch Grimshader, Isle of Lewis.

- On 1 December the fishing vessel SWIFTWING (LK1) sank immediately west of Out Skerries, Shetland. Following discussions with the MCA and the SOSREP, the NLV PHAROS diverted to survey the reported position but was unable to locate the wreck.

- On 16 January a 72ft fishing trawler ran aground in Kylerhea Narrows, off Skye. The vessel was subsequently refloated and escorted to Mallaig by the local RNLI lifeboat.

None of the incidents were as a result of an AtoN failure.

- AtoN Inspections - At the end of November 23, 1369 Local Lighthouse Authority (LLA) AtoN had been inspected out of a possible 2371 (57.7%) during the reporting year (April-March). The annual inspection target is 70%.

  Over the same period 434 NLB AtoN had been inspected out of a possible 485 (89.5%).

- Marine Licences - The workload of the Navigation Team, in terms of licensing cases, has increased significantly since summer 2022. This has been largely driven by Marine Scotland addressing a backlog of aquaculture site applications and by the Scotwind data-gathering phase.

- AtoN Review – In accordance with the agreed schedule, the Committee reviewed the proposals for Area 1 – Isle of Man, North Channel and Clyde and Area 2 – Mull of Kintyre to Ardnamurchan.

  The review included addressing any changes to AtoN made in the last 5 years, changes outstanding, any significant traffic changes or commercial developments, potential traffic changes due to offshore wind farm infrastructure and unlit beacons.

  The remaining 6 areas will be reviewed at forthcoming meetings until August 2024.

  Final approval dates for the NavOps Committee and the GLA CEO's Meeting are scheduled for January 2025.

- NLB User Group (NLBUG) – The next meeting of the NLBUG will be held at HQ on 14 February 2024. The meeting will be hybrid and presentations will be given by a number of NLB speakers.

<u>Escalated Matters</u>

- Planned Maintenance – AtoN and operations were impacted by the recent storms, in particular storm Babet. South Carr buoy was lost and substantial damage to the Bass Rock landing was experienced. A replacement buoy will be positioned in deeper water slightly to the north of the original position and remedial works at the Bass Rock significantly impacted original project plans for winter 2023/24.

- NLV POLE STAR - The vessel drydocked in mid-October and any outstanding defects have been resolved.

- Access Roads – Following the last update and based on the principle of common interest, we have agreed to contribute 20% share of the upgrade of the shared access to Langness Lighthouse and for the works to this section and the NLB's separate access to be managed by our neighbour.

- Helicopter – Discussions with PDG on additional extensions of contract have now been concluded and appropriate documentation has been prepared for signature w/c 22nd Jan.

- HQ refurbishment Project – NLB now has occupation of the building but the HQ contractor, Maxi, are still on-site completing snagging activities with subcontractors.

  Whilst the majority of the refurbishment has been completed there are still some teething problems with some elements of the building.

Escalated Risks

There were no escalated risks for discussion at the meeting.

The Committee reviewed Risk Card 5 – AtoN Provision and Risk Card 6 – Information Technology and Operational Technology.

The remaining Risk Cards were noted.

It was agreed that any approvals would be dealt with as they arise rather than wait until Agenda Item 10.

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies were received from Commissioner Charteris.

The Chair welcome Joe Jeffrey, Delivery and Planning Manager to his first meeting of the Navigation and Operations Committee.

2. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

The Minutes of the Navigation and Operations Committee meeting held on 18 October 2023 were agreed and can be published on the website.

Action: Senior Executive Assistant

3. MATTERS ARISING

The Committee noted the update provided within the meeting pack. The majority of outstanding Matters Arising from the previous meeting would be addressed within the relevant subject areas.

Isle of Man Harbours – The Isle of Man Territorial Seas Committee (TSC) at its last meeting considered the attendance of NLB as a standing member. It decided that this would not be necessary. It was recognised attendance when applicable matters were being discussed may be appropriate.

Environmental – Continuing to review the low water level rise and mitigations. Objective set to complete by end of January 2024 and will be brought to the next meeting in April 2024.

Action: Asset Manager

Project Spend – The total project forecast has been included in the meeting report. This comprises the actual spend from prior years and the forecast for the current year along with any forecast/budget in future years to complete.

Q4 Dashboard – The Committee noted and approved the revised Q4 Dashboard. This format will be used for future meetings going forward.

Butt of Lewis, Galson Trust – Further meetings are being scheduled with the Trust. The Asset Manger will update the Committee as appropriate.

4. NAVIGATIONAL REQUIREMENTS

The Committee noted the report and discussion took place on the following items:

Incidents

- SUSTAIN - The fishing vessel SUSTAIN UL45 ran aground opposite Rubha Cadail, Loch Broom on 16 November Attempts to refloat her have proved unsuccessful to date.

- GAS ARJUNA – The 90 metre LPG carrier GAS ARJUNA suffered steering gear failure NW of Stroma on 23 November, whilst attempting a Pentland Firth transit with the tide (4 kts) and against the wind (25 kts NW). The Director of Operations and Navigation Manager has met with the MCA and has reminded them of their action to implement warnings in such circumstances. The Pentland Firth is to become an IMO recognised reporting scheme which is expected to deliver full take up of vessel reporting during transit. NLB's proposal is, at the point when the reports are made and in circumstance where there are rough seas forecast or being observed, the vessels transiting as so warned. NLB has put a paper together which will now go to the UK SAR Consultative Group on 17 January 2024.

  Commissioner Archibald asked what the thresholds are for issuing a warning noting local knowledge will be hugely important. The Director of Operations advised that there needs to be some sort of mechanism of triggering a warning for a coastguard operator to raise. There is a case for some further observations to be done of sea state in these areas in relation to what level of wind speed might trigger a warning which could be done through observations or a LIDAR arrangement on a temporary basis.

- The feed barge at Gob a Bharra fish farm, Loch Fyne sank on or around 27 November. Peel Ports issued a Notice to Mariners (NTM) on 1 January advising recover operations are commencing.

- FV HEATHER ISLE - The fishing boat FV HEATHER ISLE sank at the inland end of Loch Grimshader on 28 November.

- SWIFTWING LK 1 - The fishing vessel SWIFTWING LK1 sank immediately West of Out Skerries on 1 December. At the request of MCA, NLV PHAROS diverted from the rig trip to survey the reported position but was unable to find the wreck at the reported position.

- NISEA - The fishing vessel NISEA ran aground at Belnahua, West of Luing. One casualty was declared deceased.

- On 16 January a 72ft fishing trawler ran aground in Kylerhea Narrows, off Skye. The vessel was subsequently refloated and escorted to Mallaig by the local RNLI lifeboat.

None of the incidents were as a result of an AtoN failure.

2020 AtoN Review

The Committee noted the 2020 AtoN Review tracker.

NLB User Group

The NLB User Group will be held on 14 February 2024. There is still the action to correspond with the suggested list of consultees.

Audit
An audit was undertaken at Angus Council (Arbroath) on 1 November 2023.

IALA Guideline on resilient PNT
The IALA Council have approved the publication of new guidance on resilient Position, Navigation and Timing (replacing Recommendation R129).

The Chair asked if NLB had been involved in the drafting of the new guidance and if there was anything to highlight which would have an impact. The Navigation Manager advised that NLB had not been involved in this iteration of the guidance. As guidance applies to all members of IALA and is kept at a general level. The UK is following their own policies. The Director of Operations added that a new area which this guidance become more applicable is around autonomous vessels. At the moment most autonomous vessels are using GNSS solely as a position reference and IALA's position has been to recommend that they utilise the physical aids to navigation that are also provided. This is an ongoing debate in relation to both domestic and international legislation on the use of MASTS and what the coastal states expect in terms of navigational techniques and technologies used.

South Carr Buoy
South Carr buoy disappeared from station around Storm Babet and has not been recovered. Discussion with NLB Masters suggest that the buoy station would be more resilient if it were moved 2 cables North, to the 15-metre contour. Traffic analysis suggests that local fishing vessels already pass south of the buoy, presumably using the beacon for reference. It was noted that the buoy is a relatively new buoy station. Originally the plan had been to light the South Carr Beacon but the ownership had been in doubt therefore the decision was to put a buoy in. As part of the AtoN Review this station will be looked at to see if it is still necessary. In the meantime, the proposal to move the buoy to the 15-metre contour was agreed.

Action: Navigation Manager

Aids to Navigation Inspections
At the end of November, 1369 LLA AtoN had been inspected out of a possible 2371 (57.7%) during the reporting year. 119 AtoN are recorded as not inspected within the last 3 years, however this includes newly established and occasional AtoNs, as well as some not visible from inspecting ships. 69 faults remained outstanding at the end of the month; these are followed up by Navigation staff.

434 GLA AtoN have been inspected out of a possible 485 (89.5%). 4 GLA AtoN are currently out with the 3-year maximum inspection period (Esha Ness, Foula, Ve Skerries light & racon).

GNSS update
Beidou-3 satellites M25 & M26 were launched on 26 December 2023 and are currently on test.

Annual Offshore Oil & Gas Inspection voyage
NLV PHAROS undertook the annual offshore inspection voyage between 30 November and 5 December 2023. Platforms to the West and East of Shetland, and as far South as the Scott Field, were inspected before the weather broke. A further attempt will be made to inspect the Central North Sea platforms in the New Year.

Inspection results were positive - 53 inspections were undertaken with only 3 failures identified. There were 4 partial inspections where platforms were either day shift only and unable to sound fog signal manually or were unmanned at the time – in all cases the in-field ERRV was contacted and details of monthly AtoN checks were provided when requested.

Optic Options for Esha Ness Capital Refurbishment (2025/26)
Optic technology has moved on significantly since the time of writing the Esha Ness AtoN Options Report and Sealite Optics could now obtain the 18nm range with a pair of single-tier SL300-1D5-1W

optics in duty-standby configuration. It was therefore suggested during a recent Design Review for Esha Ness that this Sealite option should be revisited.

The Project team are confident that the minimum range of 18nm can be met noting the Sealite Optics would have less installation costs given a simpler design and has less ongoing maintenance requirements. The emergency light would also be 18nm.

The Committee discussed the options available and agreed where costs can be minimised through simpler maintenance and operationally acceptable in the long-term it should be considered. It was agreed that item would be discussed further internally to agree a way forward. The Committee were content to leave any decision to the Executive and Programme and Project Board. The wording around light range will made clearer at the next AtoN Review.

Marine Licence and Sanction Requests

The Committee noted the summary of Marine Licence Activity and Sanctions for the establishment/ disestablishment of AtoN as required under the Navigation Committee Terms of Reference.

There has been a surge in workload since summer 2022, largely driven by Marine Scotland addressing a backlog of aquaculture site applications, and by the Scotwind data-gathering phase. The Scotwind licensing round has generated a number of meetings and applications for data gathering buoys & seabed sampling to date.

2025 AtoN Review Proposals

The Committee noted:

- Changes made in the last 5-year programme
- Changes outstanding
- Signification Traffic changes in last 5 years
- Developments within the last 5 years
- Potential traffic changes
- Unlit beacon in the area

Area 1 – Isle of Man, North Channel and Clyde

Initial recommendations:

- Transfer Spit of Scaur buoy to Loch Ryan Harbour Authority.
- Re-engineer Little Ross lighthouse with an LED light. A revenue refurbishment is scheduled for 2026. The existing light *(fl 0.5s; ec 4.5s)* was intended to operate in synchronisation with the lower beacon *(fl 1s; ec 1s. fl 1s; ec 2s)* to form a leading line, however the synchronisation frequently failed. A similar but more reliable effect would be achieved by extending the flash character of the main light to *(fl 1s; ec 4s)* and altering the beacon light to flash QR *(fl 0.4s; ec 0.6s)*. The current light ranges are appropriate.

Commissioner Archibald asked if the discussion around changing the character of Little Ross from white to red was in consultation with the harbour authority. The Navigation Manager advised that this will be discussed with the harbour authority but they are aware of the trial.

Area 2 – Mull of Kintyre to Ardnamurchan

Initial recommendations:

- To narrow the southern white sector of Fladda light, from the current 344°-356°(12°) to 347°-354°(7°). The Optic is a biform Tideland ML300 Sectored Lantern installed in 2013 at last major refurbishment. Next Capital refurbishment is due in 2032, however replacement of the light filters is feasible.
- To establish a small pole-mounted minor light, flashing green every 2 seconds with a nominal range of 2M, on Funaich Bheag in the Sound of Luing.
- To monitor the Machair OWF development and any potential change in the significance of Dubh Artach lighthouse.

The Director of Operations advised that the narrowing of the southern white sector of Fladda light was as a result of the hydrography changing considerably and will take vessels clear of the shallow patch.

The Chief Executive asked, given the implications of the Machair windfarm, was the design and planning for Dubh Artach's refurbishment in 2030-2032 was too soon to make a decision on whether a lessor range was appropriate. The Director of Operations advised that as part of this AtoN review a decision on whether a 15-mile range would be suitable could be considered noting a longer-range light might not be the right thing to do depending on the windfarm position.

5. OPERATIONS REPORT

The Committee noted and discussed the Operations report:

AtoN Availability
The Committee noted the 3 year rolling availability figures to 8 January 2024.

Category 1 availability is at 99.82% which is on the IALA standard and a slight increase since the last meeting.

Category 2 and Category 3 availability remains above the IALA standard.

Outages
Since the last committee there has been 4 outages over 72 hours. All outages were protracted due to weather and vessel availability.

Ships Downtime
There has been no downtime for NLV PHAROS since the last meeting. NLV POLE STAR has had 10 days of downtime due to the dry dock in October 2023.

Maintenance
The Committee noted the Q4 Dashboard. Overall Planned maintenance overdues are reported as 25.1% a 3.5% increase from the last report.

Operations Projects
The Committee noted the Project Dashboard which was included in the meeting pack. Temporary lights for project work remain at Fair Isle South (Skadan), Start Point, Lunna Holm, Cava, Oigh Sgeir and Sumburgh Head.

Assets

Access Roads - Following the last meeting, NLB have agreed to contribute a 20% share of the upgrade of the shared access to Langness Lighthouse and for the works to this section and the NLB's separate access to be managed by our neighbour. This is based on the principle of common interest in the shared length of access.

Butt of Lewis, Galson Trust - NLB have had some initial internal meetings with Assets, Programme and Renewals and the Business Development Manager who is now looking to set up a meeting with the Trust to look at how best to take the proposed development forward, a report will be provided to the Executive and the Navigation and Operations Committee.

Action: Asset Manager

RAAC – A comprehensive Desk Top Study was carried out on the Estate and no RAAC has been identified.

AtoN Lightning Protection - A Tri-GLA training session with members of staff from TH, IL, Delivery & Planning and Programme & Renewals was arranged on the various parts of the British Standard and it was agreed that the 3 GLA's would have a common approach to Lightning Protection based on the guidance given on the course.

A follow up training course, to be held in Spring, including TH and IL staff is being arranged looking at Risk Assessment Software, Isolated Lightning Protection Systems (external aspects such as down conductors), and Surge Protection in line with BS 7671.

Commissioner Archibald asked if NLB were at a higher risk of lightning strike due to the uncertainty around the status of the lightning protection. The Programme and Renewals advised that this is a new standard and the only recommended to come out of the training is that NLB currently only use one cable and advice is there should be 2. It was noted that the Principle Electrical Engineer is looking at individual risk assessments for all sites, carrying out a holistic assessment and look at surge protection. Where necessary, lightning protection will be installed to the new standard. GRAD are also doing an investigation into lightning protection and are looking at updating the IALA Standard. There is no major increase in risk.

Rubh Reidh Welfare Block - Through the voluntary registration of NLB's estate for Rubh Reidh Lighthouse it was established that the solum of the welfare block, which sits outside the lighthouse compound, is not in the ownership of NLB. Liaison is ongoing with GBB Estates to arrange either a voluntary transfer or a straightforward disposition of the land.

Escalated Matters

(i) Planned Operations
AtoN and operations were impacted by the recent storms in particular storm Babet. South Carr buoy was lost and substantial damage to the Bass rock landing was experienced. In addition, a number of contract buoys were washed ashore or off position.

(ii) Monitoring
Some 30 RTU remain to be replaced across the estate. The replacement project is progressing well and remains on track to be complete by 2024 prior to PSTN switch off.

(iii) Project Site Access
The ongoing and protracted weather delays at Sule Skerry leading to a third year of little progress, along with Bass rock restrictions, have had a significant impact on NLB planned activities. Legal advice is being prepared on NLB as a public body's ability to access sites out with Nature Scot agreed restrictions. This will be the basis of further discussions with NatureScot on working through the closed period at these sites.

(iv) Vessels

NLV POLE STAR: The vessel dry docked in mid-October 2023. The previously reported anchor windlass crown wheel defect and all other defects were resolved during this period. Significantly affected by weather the vessel is fully operational.

NLV PHAROS: The vessel is operating normally. The Steel workboat has been fitted with new buoyancy tanks and cabin doors and is now fully compliant with the work boat code requirements.

(v) Vessel Replacement
As a major strategic project this will be reported on at the Governance Board.

(vi) Oban Base
No significant Matters to report.

(vii) Oban Harbour
The Director of Operations provided an update on the development of the Harbour Revision Order (HRO).

Environmental

Work has been done on the draft Asset Management Plan following the comments that were received and the document is now being finalised before publication this financial year.

The wind turbine at Start Point has been commissioned.

6. BUSINESS SERVICES

Procurement
Supplier Issue – Babcock Dry Dock Framework Agreement – A positive discussion took place between Babcock and NLB on 19 December 2023 where both sides frankly discussed the issues and learnings in creating and implementing the framework agreement. Actions were agreed for future works and lessons learnt processed into quality management systems. Both parties acknowledged the benefit of the discussions.

Aviation Services Contract – Discussions with the contactor on additional extensions of contract have been concluded and appropriate documentation has been prepared.

Legal Services – NLB has recently appointed two suppliers to provide legal services. Brodies will provide HR and Estates support and CMS will provide Commercial and Maritime services.

Business Development
The Committee noted the update on commercial work.

HQ Building and Operation Jigsaw
NLB now has occupation of the building but the HQ contractor, Maxi, are still on-site completing snagging activities with subcontractors.

The return of furniture to HQ has been delayed due to issues with supplier. It is now hoped that all office furniture will be installed in 84 George Street in January. The antiques are due to return week commencing 19th February.

Planning is underway to re-establish services which were suspended during the works (e.g., window cleaning) and to identify any additional incidentals to be acquired for employees to return to the building.

A full report on the project, from inception to conclusion, detailing cost changes will be provided to the next meeting.

Action: Director of Business Services

ICT
HQ Relocation of Server Room – The transfer of equipment from the basement to the first floor was successfully completed at the end of October 2023. There are a few minor issues which have been captured on the snagging list and a few outstanding items such as patch cable testing results and new systems operational documentation (e.g air conditioning and fire suppression).

Finance
Quinquennial Revaluation Exercise – In October 2023, NAO advised that their specialist valuer (RHDHV) had queried the steel cost indices used and requested the valuations were rerun. The indices used by Pelling's in the construct of the costings were from November 2022 and had not

been updated reflect March 2023 prices - the movement between these times resulted in a material adjustment being required to the financial statements of a decrease in the value of the assets.

Further questions were raised in December 2023 regarding the revaluation of assets based on the location factor applied to the MEA. Specifically, where MEA's costings were complete for one location type, but were being applied to other location types and where costing information was not within the matrix. This resulted in NLB's asset manager reviewing the locations of the MEA's and providing a response for each conflict. This change resulted in a further adjustment to the asset value.

NLB will continue to monitor whether the HMT review of non-investment asset valuations may reduce this burden in future years.

Project Spend – The Committee noted that summary of the 2023/24 project spend for capital and revenue to Period 9 (31 December 2023). Following the October meeting, an additional column has been added to show the forecast spend for each project, this comprises any prior year's actual spending, the current year forecast and any forecast or budget spend for future years.

7. NOTICES TO MARINERS

The 3 Notices to Mariners (NtM 10 of 2023, NtM 01 of 2024 and NtM 02 of 2024) published since the last meeting were noted.

It was agreed that Navigation and Operations Committee members would be added to the circulation list for NtMs going forward.

Action: Navigation Officer

8. ESCALATED RISKS AND RISK CARD REVIEW

Escalated Risks
There no escalated risks highlighted for discussion at this meeting.

Risk Card Review
The Committee reviewed Risk Cards Numbers: 5 – AtoN Provision and 6 – Information Technology and Information Technology and noted Risk Card Numbers 8 – Exploitation of Reserve Capacity; 9 – Technological Change; 10 – Asset Loss/Damage; 12 – Natural Events and 15 – Climate Emergency (Adaptation) are attached for noting.

AtoN Provision
- Additional Action – Move "GRAD and NLB response to BEIS consultation on the phase out of traditional (metal halide) lamp technology by December 2023" to Control & Treatment.
- Additional Action – Move "Ongoing review of overdue maintenance tasks by Asset Management Team" to Control & Treatment.

9. POLICY APPROVALS

Any approvals required were covered under the appropriate Agenda Item.

10. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

NLB User Group
The Chair asked for an update on the list of attendees. The Navigation Manager advised that there is a comprehensive list of addressees that are invited to the meeting. The plan is to run it as a hybrid meeting with the option to attend in person. The agenda this is year is made up of internal speakers

and the main items to discuss are the vessel replacement project, sustainability, Sumburgh Head refurbishment, Start Point wind turbine, AtoN Review and an update on IALA. Any suggestions on other topics would be gratefully received.

The next NLB User Group will be held in early November 2024 thereafter the normal meeting cycle will resume.

Inspection Voyages
The Committee noted the dates for Inspection Voyages in 2024:

13-16 May 2024 – Voyage 1
16-19 May 2024 – Voyage 2

11. ASSURANCE STATEMENT

The Chair will circulate a draft Assurance Statement following the meeting. Committee Members are requested to send any comments/amendment to the Chair over the next few days.

Action: All

12. DATE AND TIME OF NEXT MEETING

The next meeting of the Navigation and Operations Committee will take place on 17 April 2024 at 10.00am. This will be an in-person meeting.